



**MINUTES
HISTORICAL ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
REGULAR MEETING OF FEBRUARY 6, 2014**

CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Price called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

PRESENT: Chairperson Price, Board Members Bresler, Shaiq, Adamson (arrived at 6:35 p.m.)

ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Kristie Wheeler, Planning Manager
Bronwen Lacey, Deputy City Attorney
Spencer Shafsky, Planner I

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Regular meetings of October 3, and December 19, 2013
Moved (Price/Shaiq) to approve minutes with minor corrections. Motion carried 3-0-1 (Adamson arrived late)

ELECTION OF OFFICERS 2014 Moved (Shaiq/Bressler) to re-elect Price Chairperson and Adamson Vice Chairperson. Motion carried 4-0-0.

CONSENT CALENDAR None

PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS None

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS None

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

- Item 1. **AT&T WIRELESS MONO EUCALYPTUS – 42955 Palm Avenue – (PLN2014-00067)** - To consider historical architectural review by HARB to remove an existing stealth monopole & replace it with a new 70 foot tall "mono-eucalyptus" pole located in the Mission San Jose Planning Area. A Negative Declaration has been prepared and circulated for this project in accordance with the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

Planner Shafsky presented the proposed project.

Board Member Bresler asked why the proposed monoecalyptus is moving from the location of the existing monopole that it is replacing. Would it be less visually obtrusive?

Rajesh Raikar, on behalf of the applicant, responded that the proposed location would be slightly different to provide room necessary for installation. The monoecalyptus would be 75 feet in height where the existing monopole is 60 feet in height so it would be a larger monopole. He also responded that the proposed monoecalyptus would be less visually obtrusive because the antenna on the monopole would be screened by the eucalyptus design.

Board Member Adamson asked why the monoecalyptus design was proposed. Was it for aesthetic reasons?

Mr. Raikar responded, yes. The proposed monoecalyptus would have more antenna array and the eucalyptus design would help screen the antenna.

Chairperson Price commented that based on the photosimulations, it appears that the proposed monoecalyptus would fit in.

IT WAS MOVED (PRICE/ADAMSON) AND CARRIED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE (4-0-0-0) THAT THE HISTORICAL ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD: RECOMMENDED THAT THE PLANNING COMMISSION CERTIFY THE NEGATIVE DECLARATION AND FIND THESE ACTIONS REFLECT THE INDEPENDENT JUDGMENT OF THE CITY OF FREMONT;

AND

FOUND PLN2014-00067 TO BE COMPATIBLE WITH EXISTING DEVELOPMENT IN THE MISSION SAN JOSE HISTORICAL OVERLAY DISTRICT AND IN CONFORMANCE WITH THE HISTORICAL OVERLAY DISTRICT'S DESIGN GUIDELINES AND REGULATIONS;

AND

RECOMMENDED THAT PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVE AT&T WIRELESS MONOEUCALYPTUS, AS SHOWN ON EXHIBIT "C," SUBJECT TO FINDINGS AND CONDITIONS ON EXHIBIT "B" WITH REVISED CONDITIONS #10 AND #14.

The motion carried by the following vote:

| | |
|----------|------------------------------------|
| AYES: | 4 – Adamson, Bresler, Price, Shaiq |
| NOES: | 0 |
| ABSTAIN: | 0 |
| ABSENT: | 0 |

- Item 2. **VERIZON MONO PALM – 37296 Mission Boulevard – (PLN2014-00091)** - To consider historical architectural review by HARB for a proposed 85 foot tall "mono-palm" to be in the Niles Community Plan Area. A Negative Declaration has been prepared and circulated for this project in accordance with the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

Planner Shafsky presented the proposed project.

Chairperson Price asked why the proposed location was chosen as it seems too close to the street.

Pamela Nobel, on behalf of the applicant, responded that the proposed location is as far back from the street as possible to meet service needs. She also mentioned that there was a previous proposal on the site in the same location. In addition, the proposed monopalm would have a grove of palms as a backdrop.

Ms. Nobel and HARB reviewed discussed the photosimulations submitted for the proposed monopalm.

Chairperson Price expressed concern that the proposed monopalm would stick out like a sore thumb.

Ms. Nobel pointed out proposed palm materials. She also indicated that the proposed monopalm would be setback 40 feet from the street.

Chairperson Price reiterated that he felt the proposed location was the wrong place.

Board Member Shaiq pointed out that from one perspective it looked close to the street but from other vantage points it looked further back.

Board Member Adamson asked if you would be able to see the monopalm from downtown Niles. Could it be shorter?

Ms. Nobel responded that you would likely be able to see the monopalm from downtown Niles and a shorter pole would result in lost coverage. More capacity is needed because of demand for service and, thus, the taller pole is required to meet that need.

Board Member Adamson said she felt the aesthetics of the area are already compromised with many ugly utility poles and the proposed monopalm would be an improvement.

Board Member Bresler agreed. He said to have a system that works you need to a pole like the one proposed.

Ms. Nobel further described the site selection process.

Chairperson Price stated that a greater effort should have been made to locate the monopalm on the Bellini property so that it would blend in better. He said he would like it moved back 20 feet or somehow have it blend with the existing palm grove.

Board Member Shaiq pointed out that the existing utility poles could be removed at some point in the future but the monopole would still be there.

Board Member Adamson said that compared to other evils, the proposed monopalm would not be that bad.

Moved (Adamson/Bresler) to approve with revised conditions #10 and #14. Motion carried 3-0-1 (Price opposed).

IT WAS MOVED (ADAMSON/BRESLER) AND CARRIED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE (3-1-0-0) THAT THE HISTORICAL ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD: RECOMMENDED OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION CERTIFY THE NEGATIVE DECLARATION AND FIND THESE ACTIONS REFLECT THE INDEPENDENT JUDGMENT OF THE CITY OF FREMONT;

AND

FOUND PLN2014-00091 TO BE COMPATIBLE WITH EXISTING DEVELOPMENTS IN THE NILES HISTORIC OVERLAY DISTRICT AND IN CONFORMANCE WITH THE NILES DESIGN GUIDELINES AND REGULATIONS;

AND

RECOMMENDED THAT PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVE VERIZON MISSION MONOPALM, AS SHOWN ON EXHIBIT "C," SUBJECT TO FINDINGS AND CONDITIONS ON EXHIBIT "B" WITH REVISED CONDITIONS TO #10 AND #14.

The motion carried by the following vote:

| | |
|----------|-----------------------------|
| AYES: | 3 – Adamson, Bresler, Shaiq |
| NOES: | 1 – Price |
| ABSTAIN: | 0 |
| ABSENT: | 0 |

MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS - None

Meeting adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

APPROVED BY:



Kristie Wheeler, Secretary
Historical Architectural Review Board